



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

Chullin Daf Tzaddik Aleph

- The Gemara asked whether **R' Yehuda** is certain that the issur of gid hanasheh only applies to the gid hanasheh of the right thigh or whether he is uncertain which side it applies to.
 - **Q:** Maybe we can answer from a Mishna. The Mishna says, if a person ate a kezayis from the gid hanasheh of each thigh, he gets 2 sets of malkus. **R' Yehuda** says he only gets one set of malkus. Now, if **R' Yehuda** is certain that it only applies to the right side, that is why he gets malkus. However, if he is not sure which side it applies to, the warning is given in safek, and we find that **R' Yehuda** says that a warning given in safek is not a valid warning and cannot lead to one getting malkus! **A:** It may be that the Tanna of this Mishna holds like a different version of **R' Yehuda**, which says that he holds that a warning given in safek is a valid warning.
 - The Gemara says we can answer from a Braisa. The Braisa says, if a person ate 2 gid hanashehs from 2 thighs of 2 different animals, he gets 2 sets of malkus. **R' Yehuda** says he only gets one set. Now, from the fact that the Braisa discusses "2 thighs of 2 different animals" it is clear that it is referring to the same side of the animals (if they were from different sides the Braisa could have discussed one animal). The only reason to do so was to be able to discuss the view of **R' Yehuda** in a case where he too agreed that the person ate two issurim. From the fact that he ate both from the same side of an animal, and yet **R' Yehuda** says he is chayuv malkus, this proves that **R' Yehuda** is certain that it is the gid hanasheh of the right side that is assur. SHEMAH MINAH.
 - **Q:** If so, why does he say the person is only chayuv one set of malkus? **A:** The case is that each one is less than a kezayis, and only together is there a kezayis. We see in a Braisa that **R' Yehuda** says he is chayuv only if he ate a kezayis of the gid hanasheh.
- **Q:** From where does **R' Yehuda** learn that the issur only applies to the gid hanasheh of the right side? **A:** **Rava** said, the pasuk says "*hayareich*" ("*the thigh*"), which suggests it refers to the most prestigious thigh – which is the right thigh.
 - The **Rabanan** (who say that both sides are assur) say that the "the" teaches the issur is on the sinew that goes through the entire thigh, which comes to exclude the outer sinew from being assur.
 - **R' Yehoshua ben Levi** said, the pasuk says "*b'hei'avko imo*". This teaches that Yaakov and the Malach were fighting and entangled so that the Malach's right hand was wrapped around Yaakov and reached Yaakov's right thigh from behind.
 - **R' Shmuel bar Nachmeini** said the Malach appeared to Yaakov like a goy, and we have learned that when walking with a goy, a Yid should make sure to keep the goy on his right side. Therefore, Yaakov's right thigh was closest to the Malach. **R' Shmuel bar Acha in the name of Rava bar Ulla** said in front of **R' Pappa**, that the Malach appeared to Yaakov like a talmid chochom, and we have learned that when walking with a talmid chochom, a person should have the talmid chochom walk to his right. Therefore, Yaakov's right thigh was closest to the Malach.
 - The **Rabanan** say that the Malach attacked Yaakov from behind and dislocated both of his thighs (which is why both gid hanashehs are assur). They darshen the pasuk of "*b'hei'avko imo*" as **R' Yehoshua ben Levi** did, to teach that as they wrestled they kicked up dust that rose up to the Kisei Hakavod.
 - **R' Yehoshua ben Levi** said, it is called the "gid hanasheh" because it moved from its place ("*nasha*") and went up.

- **R' Yose the son of R' Chanina** darshened a pasuk: “davar shaliach b'Yaakov” – refers to the gid hanasheh, “v'nafal b'Yisrael” refers to the fact that it became assur to all of Klal Yisrael.
- **R' Yose the son of R' Chanina** also darshened, the pasuk says “tevo'ach tevach”, which teaches that Yosef told his people to make sure his brothers could see the place of the shechita to ascertain that it was valid, and “v'hachein” teaches that he told them to remove the gid hanasheh in front of them.
 - This follows the view that the gid hanasheh is even assur for Bnei Noach (which is the status that the Yidden had before Matan Torah).
- The pasuk says “vayivaser Yaakov l'vado”. **R' Elazar** said, he remained there alone because he went to get some small jars that he had left. We learn from here that tzaddikim consider their money more beloved than their life. The reason for that is because they don't want to become poor and then be tempted to steal.
- The pasuk says “vayeiveik ish imo ahd alos hashachar”. **R' Yitzchak** said, we learn from here that a talmid chochom should not go out at night alone. **R' Abba bar Kahana** learns this from a pasuk regarding Boaz. **R' Avahu** learns it from Avrohom (he didn't leave until the morning). The **Rabanan** learn it from the pasuk that tells of Yaakov sending Yosef to check on his brothers (the pasuk says “see” how they are doing – which means it must have been daytime). **Rav** learns this from the fact that Yaakov spent the night in Beis Eil when Hashem made the sun set early for him. We see that he wouldn't travel once the sun set.
 - Regarding Yaakov's night in Beis Eil, one pasuk says “vayikach mei'avnei hamakom” (from the “stones”, plural) and another pasuk says “vayikach es ha'even” (one stone). **R' Yitzchak** said, this teaches that the stones were fighting to have Yaakov put his head on them. Hashem made a neis and they became joined into one stone.
 - The pasuk says “vayachalom v'hinei sulam mutzav artzah”. A Braisa says, the width of the ladder was 8,000 parsah. This is based on the pasuk that says that there were Malachim going up and coming down on it. “Going up” is written in the plural, which means there were two, side by side going up, and the same is true for those going down. When they passed each other there had to be enough room for 4 Malachim to be side by side. A pasuk says that a Malach is the size of Tarshish, which we have a kabbalah is 2,000 parsah wide.
 - A Braisa says, they went up to look at the image on the Kisei Hakavod and came down to look at Yaakov (Yaakov's image is on the Kisei Hakavod). They became jealous and wanted to harm him. The pasuk therefore says “v'hinei Hashem nitzav alav” to protect him. **Reish Lakish** said, if not for the pasuk we could not say this. Hashem was like a father who fans his son to protect him from the heat.
 - The pasuk says that Hashem promised to give Yaakov “haaretz asher atah shocheiv aleha...”. Why is that a great promise (for such a small piece of land)? **R' Yitzchak** said, this teaches that Hashem folded up the entire EY and put it under Yaakov, so that it should be easy for his children to conquer it (as one can easily conquer the 4 amos in which he stands).
- The pasuk says that the Malach told Yaakov “shalcheini ki alah hashachar”. Yaakov asked him, are you a thief or kidnapper who is afraid of the daytime? The Malach said, from the time of Creation I have never said shira to Hashem, and today is my chance to do so.
 - This supports **R' Chananel in the name of Rav**, who says that every day there are 3 new groups of Malachim who say shira – one says “Kadosh”, the second says “Kadosh”, and the third says “Kadosh Hashem Tzevakos”.

- **Q:** A Braisa says that the Yidden are more beloved to Hashem than are the Malachim, because the Yidden say shira at all times whereas Malachim rarely have a chance to do so, and also, Yidden say Hashem's Name after two words – "Shema Yisrael, Hashem", and Malachim only say the Name after 3 words – "Kadosh, kadosh kadosh, Hashem". Now, according to **R' Chananel in the name of Rav**, the third group says the Name after just one word!? **A:** Rather, **R' Chananel in the name of Rav** must have said that the first group says "Kadosh", the second says "Kadosh, kadosh", and the third says "Kadosh, kadosh, kadosh Hashem Tzevakos".
 - **Q:** There is the shira of "Baruch kevod Hashem", where the Malachim say the Name after just 2 words!? **A:** It is only the "Ofanim" who say this shira, not the regular Malachim. **A2:** Once they have said "Kadosh, kadosh, kadosh, Hashem", they are then permitted to say the Name even after less than 3 words.