



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

Menachos Daf Mem Beis

- A Braisa says, the word "tzitzis" refers to loose fringes, as we see in the pasuk of "b'tzitzis roshi". **Abaye** said, these strings must be separated like the hair of the Arama'im.
- A Braisa says, if one puts the tzitzis on the tip or the border of the garment, it is valid. **R' Eliezer ben Yaakov** says that both these cases would be passul.
 - **Q:** Whose view does **R' Gidal in the name of Rav** follow when he says that the tzitzis should hit against the tip of the garment, based on the pasuk of "ahl kanfei bigdeyhem"? **A:** He follows **R' Eliezer ben Yaakov** (who says that it can't be attached at the end).
 - **R' Yaakov in the name of R' Yochanan** said, the tzitzis should be placed the distance of the full joint of the thumb, from the end of the garment.
 - We need the ruling of **R' Pappa** (who said it should not be placed more than 3 etzba'os off the corner), because from **R' Yaakov** we would think that the further off the corner the better. We need the ruling of **R' Yaakov**, because from **R' Pappa** we would think that the closer to the end the better.
 - **R' Sama** saw that the hole in which the tzitzis of **Ravina** was placed was ripped, causing the tzitzis to be less than the joint of a thumb away from the end. He asked him, do you not hold of **R' Yaakov**? **Ravina** said, that is only when making the tzitzis, but if it rips later it is not a problem. **R' Sama** was embarrassed for not knowing that. **R' Ashi** told him not to be embarrassed, because **Ravina** was from EY, and every chochom in EY is equal to two chachomim of Bavel.
 - **R' Acha bar Yaakov** would fold the 4 strings in half and then put that through the hole in the garment, because he held it should go into the garment as 8 strings. **R' Yirmiya MiDifti** would put 8 strings without folding them, which would become a total of 16 when they hung out of both sides of the garment. **Mar the son of Ravina** would do like we do (put 4 strings through without folding them, which would make a total of 8 strings once they were through the garment).
- **R' Nachman** saw **R' Ada bar Ahava** make a bracha on the making of the tzitzis. He told him that **Rav** said there is no bracha made on the making of tzitzis.
 - When **R' Huna** was niftar, **R' Chisda** went into the Beis Medrash and asked, how can **Rav** have said that the making of tzitzis doesn't require a bracha? We find that **R' Yehuda in the name of Rav** said that tzitzis made by goyim is passul based on the pasuk of "daber ehl Bnei Yisrael...v'asu lahem tzitzis"!?
 - **Q:** Why is that a contradiction to the ruling of **Rav**? **A:** **R' Yosef** said, it is because **R' Chisda** holds that any mitzvah that is valid when done by a goy does not require a bracha when done by a Yid, but a mitzvah that is passul when done by a goy does require a bracha when done by a Yid.
 - **Q:** We find that a milah done by a goy is valid, and yet the halacha is that a Yid who does the milah must make a bracha!? **A:** We are asking according to **Rav**, and **Rav** holds that a milah done by a goy is passul.
 - **Q:** The case of succah supports **R' Yosef's** explanation, because a Braisa says that a succah built by a goy is valid, and a Braisa says that there is no bracha made on the building of a succah. However, the case of tefillin refutes **R' Yosef's** explanation, because tefillin written by a goy is passul, and yet a Yid does not make a bracha on the writing of the tefillin!? **A:** Rather, when the doing of the act is the completion of the mitzvah, like in the case of milah, a Yid makes a bracha when doing it,

even though it is valid if done by a goy. When doing the act is not the completion of the mitzvah, like in the case of tefillin, even though it is passul when done by a goy, a Yid would not make a bracha when doing it. With regard to the making of tzitzis the machlokes is that **R' Chisda** holds the tzitzis is an obligation on the garment, even if it is not worn, and therefore the putting of the tzitzis is the completion of the mitzvah, whereas **R' Nachman** holds that it is an obligation on the person which is fulfilled when the garment is worn.

- **R' Mordechai** said to **R' Ashi**, we have learned a different version of the above and have learned that **R' Yehuda in the name of Rav** said that tzitzis made by a goy are valid based on the pasuk of “daber ehl Bnei Yisrael...V'asu lahem tzitzis”, which teaches that “tzitzis should be made for you”, even by a goy.
- **R' Yehuda in the name of Rav** said, if one leaves strings from the making of the garment, attached at the corner for tzitzis, it is passul. However, if one takes regular threads and attaches them for the sake of tzitzis (even though they were not spun for the sake of tzitzis) it is valid. **R' Yehuda** said, when I repeated this to **Shmuel** he told me that it would be passul, because the spinning of the threads for tzitzis must be done for the sake of the tzitzis.
 - This is like a machlokes among Tanna'im in a Braisa, where the **T”K** says that the leather used for tefillin need not have been tanned for the sake of the mitzvah. **R' Shimon ben Gamliel** says they are passul unless they were tanned for the sake of the mitzvah.
- **Abaye** asked **R' Shmuel bar Yehuda**, how do you dye the techeiles wool? **R' Shmuel** said, we take the blood of the chilazon and some herbs, boil it in a pot, take some in an eggshell to test it on some wool, spill out whatever is left in the eggshell, and we then burn the wool that was used for the testing.
 - We learn 3 things from here: that the wool used in the test is passul, that the dyeing must be done lishma, and that the dye used for the test would make the entire pot passul.
 - **Q:** Saying that the wool used for the test is passul is saying that the dyeing must be done lishma!? **A:** It is an explanation – the reason that the wool is passul is because the dyeing must be done lishma.
 - It is actually a machlokes Tanna'im whether the dye used for the test can be used to then dye valid tzitzis. **R' Chanina ben Gamliel** says it is passul and **R' Yochanan ben Dahavai** says it is valid.