



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

### Megilla Daf Beis

### MESECHTA MEGILLA

### **PEREK RISHON -- PEREK MEGILLA NIKREIS**

#### MISHNA

- The megilla can be read on the 11<sup>th</sup>, the 12<sup>th</sup>, the 13<sup>th</sup>, the 14<sup>th</sup>, or the 15<sup>th</sup> of Adar – never before the 11<sup>th</sup> and never after the 15<sup>th</sup>.
  - Walled cities whose walls were in existence at the time of Yehoshua ben Nun read the megilla on the 15<sup>th</sup>. Other cities and villages read on the 14<sup>th</sup>. However, the villages sometimes read earlier, to allow them to read on their market days (which were on Monday and Thursday), as follows:
    - When the 14<sup>th</sup> falls out on Monday, the cities and villages read that day, and the walled cities read the next day.
    - When the 14<sup>th</sup> falls out on Tuesday or Wednesday, the cities read that day, the villages read the Monday before (either the 12<sup>th</sup> or the 13<sup>th</sup>) and the walled cities read on Wednesday (the 15<sup>th</sup>).
    - When the 14<sup>th</sup> falls out on Thursday, the cities and villages read that day, and the walled cities read the next day.
    - When the 14<sup>th</sup> falls out on Friday, the villages read on Thursday, and the cities and the walled cities read on Friday.
    - When the 14<sup>th</sup> falls out on Shabbos, the cities and villages read on Thursday, and the walled cities read on Sunday.
    - When the 14<sup>th</sup> falls out on Sunday, the villages read the previous Thursday, the cities read on Sunday, and the walled cities read on Monday.

#### GEMARA

- **Q:** How do we know that the megilla may be read on the 11<sup>th</sup>?
  - **Q:** What's the question!? The Gemara later says, the **Chachomim** allowed for this early reading so that the villagers would be free on Purim and can supply the cities with food!
  - **Q:** The Gemara explains what was meant by the question. If we allow the megilla to be read on the 11<sup>th</sup>, it must be that the Anshei Kneses Hagedolah initially instituted these earlier days as proper days for megilla, because if they had only instituted the 14<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup> as proper days, the later **Rabanan** would never have allowed it. If so, it must be learned from somewhere in the megilla that these days are proper days. Where is this seen? **A: R' Shamen bar Abba in the name of R' Yochanan** said, the pasuk says "lekayem es yimei haPurim ha'eileh **bizmaneiheim**", which means that *many* days were instituted as proper days for the reading of megilla.
    - **Q:** That word is needed to teach the days of the 14<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup>, and is not available for a drasha!? **A:** The pasuk could have said the word "zeman", and didn't have to write "zaneiheim". Since it did, we can make the drasha.
      - **Q:** The word is needed for another drasha to teach that the cities who read on the 14<sup>th</sup> do not have the option to read on the 15<sup>th</sup>, and visa-versa!? **A:** That drasha could have been made had the word only said

“zemanum”. The fact that it says “zemaneihem” allows us to make an additional drasha.

- **Q:** Why don't we say that there are many more days on which the megilla can be read? **A:** We darshen that just like there are 2 initial days (14<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup>), there are also only 2 additional days.
- **Q:** Maybe the 2 additional days are the 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup>, and the 11<sup>th</sup> should not be allowed? **A:** Like **R' Shmuel bar Yitzchak** said, the 13<sup>th</sup> is when everyone fought the war and came together, so the megilla can clearly be read on that day. The drasha is only needed for 2 additional days – the 12<sup>th</sup> and the 11<sup>th</sup>.
- **Q:** Maybe the 2 additional days are the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup>? **A:** The pasuk says “v'lo yaavor”, which means that it cannot be read after the 15<sup>th</sup>.
- **R' Shmuel bar Nachmeini** said, the additional days can be learned from the pasuk that says “kayamim asher nachu...” This teaches that “like the days” there are additional days – the 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup>.
  - **Q:** Maybe the 2 additional days are the 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup>, and the 11<sup>th</sup> should not be allowed? **A:** **R' Shmuel bar Yitzchak** said, the 13<sup>th</sup> is when everyone fought the war and came together, so the megilla can clearly be read on that day. The drasha is only needed for 2 additional days – the 12<sup>th</sup> and the 11<sup>th</sup>.
  - **Q:** Maybe the 2 additional days are the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup>? **A:** The pasuk says “v'lo yaavor”, which means that it cannot be read after the 15<sup>th</sup>.
- **R' Shmuel bar Nachmeini** doesn't learn the drasha of **R' Yochanan**, because he holds that we can't darshen the different aspects of the one word in multiple ways. **R' Yochanan** doesn't darshen like **R' Shmuel bar Nachmeini**, because he says that the pasuk of “kayamim” is teaching that the Yom Tov of Purim is to be kept in future generations.
- **Rabbah bar bar Chana in the name of R' Yochanan** says, our Mishna follows **R' Akiva**, who says that the megilla may be ready on those earlier days. However, the **Chachomim** argue with **R' Akiva** and say that it may only be read on the 14<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup>.
  - **Q:** **R' Yehuda** says in a Braisa, the megilla may be read on these earlier days only when the Yidden are not in galus. However, in today's times, since people begin Pesach 30 days after Purim, we cannot read the megilla early (because people would then begin Pesach early and eat chametz on the last few days of the real Pesach). Now, who does **R' Yehuda** follow? He can't follow **R' Akiva**, because **R' Akiva** allows the earlier days even in today's times. He must be following the **Rabanan**, and we see that they allow these earlier days for reading when the Yidden are not in galus! **A:** This is a **TEYUFTA** of **R' Yochanan**.
    - Another version said that **R' Yehuda** said that the **Chachomim** agree with **R' Akiva** that the megilla may be read on these earlier days only when the Yidden are not in galus (for the reason stated above). The Braisa is then brought as a proof.
    - **R' Ashi** had a contradiction between statements of **R' Yehuda** (one in a Mishna and one in a Braisa), and he therefore changed the Braisa to say that the statement was made by **R' Yose bar Yehuda**. The Braisa is quoted above and said that in today's times we no longer allow the reading of the megilla before the 14<sup>th</sup>. In a Mishna he says that only places that have market days on Monday and Thursday may read the megilla early. This seems to say that even in today's times it may be read early on those days. Because of this contradiction, he said that the Braisa must be **R' Yose bar Yehuda**.
      - **Q:** Just because he had a difficulty he changes the name in the Braisa? **A:** **R' Ashi** heard some say the Braisa in the name of **R' Yehuda**, and others say it in the name of **R' Yose bar Yehuda**. Since he had the

contradiction, he said it must be that the one who said it was **R' Yose bar Yehuda**.

KRACHIM HAMUKAFIM CHOMA MIMOS YEHOSHUA BEN NUN...

- **Q:** How do we know that they celebrate Purim on the 15<sup>th</sup>? **A: Rava** said, the pasuk says, “Ahl kein hayehudim haprazim hayoshvim b’arei haprazos...”, which teaches that the cities without a wall celebrate Purim on the 14<sup>th</sup>. It follows that the walled cities must be the ones who celebrate on the 15<sup>th</sup>.
  - **Q:** Maybe the walled cities do not celebrate Purim at all!? **A:** They are Yidden too! Also, the pasuk says that from Hodu to Kush they all kept Purim. This certainly includes walled cities.
  - **Q:** Maybe the walled cities have to keep Purim on the 14<sup>th</sup> and the 15<sup>th</sup>, as the pasuk says “Lihiyos osim eis yom arba’ah asar...v’eis yom chamisha asar bo...”? **A:** The separation of the 2 days with the “eis” teaches that the 2 days are not kept by the same group of people.
  - **Q:** Maybe the pasuk means that the regular cities keep the 14<sup>th</sup> and the walled cities have the option to keep the 14<sup>th</sup> or the 15<sup>th</sup>!? **A:** The pasuk says “bizmanei hem”, which teaches that the time of Purim for this group is different than for the other group.
  - **Q:** Maybe the walled cities are supposed to keep Purim on the 13<sup>th</sup>? **A:** We presume that they are to keep Purim on the same day as the people of Shushan, which is the 15<sup>th</sup>.
- **Q:** The pesukim mentioned above all deal with the keeping of the Yom Tov. How do we know that the reading of the megilla must be done on those days as well? **A:** The pasuk says “V’hayamim ha’eileh nizkarim v’naasim”, which compares the keeping of the Yom Tov to the reading of the megilla.
- Our Mishna does not follow **R' Yehoshua ben Karcha**, who says that the “walled cities” are those which have a wall from the times of Achashveirosh. His reasoning is that he compares the cities to Shushan. Just like Shushan had a wall from the times of Achashveirosh, and they read on the 15<sup>th</sup>, so too is every other city that had a wall from Achashveirosh.
  - The Tanna of our Mishna learns a gezeirah shavah on the word “perazim” to teach that just as the cities referred to when Moshe used the word had a wall from the times of Yehoshua, so too are the cities referred to in the megilla.
  - **Q: R' Yehoshua ben Karcha** doesn't learn like our Mishna, because he didn't have the tradition of this gezeirah shavah. However, why doesn't our Tanna learn like **R' Yehoshua**? **A:** Because he does have the tradition of the gezeirah shava! What is the question to begin with?
    - **Q:** The question meant was, Shushan did not have a wall from the times of Yehoshua, and yet it keeps Purim on the 15<sup>th</sup>!? **A: Rava** said, Shushan is treated differently because the miracle happened there.
  - **Q:** The pasuk says “medina u’medina, v’ihr va’ihr”. According to our Tanna this makes sense, because we are first differentiating between a city with a wall from the times of Yehoshua and one with a wall from the times of Achashveirosh, and then differentiating between the city of Shushan and all other cities. However, according to **R' Yehoshua**, we differentiate between the cities which have a wall from the times of Achashveirosh and those which don't, but there is no second differentiation to make (because Shushan is not an exception to this rule)!? **A: R' Yehoshua ben Karcha** would say, that even according to our Tanna one of the 2 phrases are not needed, because he learns the gezeirah shava of “prazi”. We must therefore say that the phrase in the pasuk can be used for a drasha to teach the Halacha of **R' Yehoshua ben Levi**, who said that even a city that is only near a walled city, or can be seen from it, is also treated as walled cities for purposes of Purim.
    - **Q:** How far can a city be and still be considered as “near” the walled city? **A: R' Yirmiya** said, as much as a “mil”.
    - **R' Yirmiya** also said, the form of the letters “mem, nun, tzaddik, pey, and chuf” (the way they are written when they are at the end of a word) was instituted by the Nevi'im.

- **Q:** The pasuk of “Eileh hamitzvos” teaches that a Navi cannot come along and institute a change to the Torah, so how can we say the Nevi'im instituted this!? Also, **R' Chisda** said that the “mem” and “samach” of the luchos stood with a miracle (because the middle of the letters floated in place, without being attached to anything). We see that the mem as written at the end of a word existed in the luchos!? **A:** It existed, but they were unaware which form of the letters were to be used in middle of a word and which were to be used at the end. The Nevi'im came and established that.
  - **Q:** That can't be, because that too would be considered as if they instituted something new to the Torah!? **A:** It was established at Sinai but then forgotten. The Nevi'im later came and reinstated which form is to be used where.