



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

Beitzah Daf Tes

MISHNA

- **B" S** say, on Yom Tov one may not move a ladder used to reach the birdhouses, from one birdhouse to another, but he may tilt the ladder from one compartment to another of the same birdhouse. **B" H** say that one may even move the ladder from one birdhouse to another.

GEMARA

- **R' Chanan bar Ami** said, the machlokes is only when he carries the birdhouse ladder through the reshus harabim. In that case **B" S** are concerned that people will see that and will think that he is bringing the ladder to plaster his roof, whereas **B" H** say, since it is the type of ladder used specifically for birdhouses, people will not think so. However, if he is only moving the ladder within the reshus hayachid, all would agree that it may be moved.
 - **Q: R' Yehuda in the name of Rav** said that whenever the **Chachomim** said something is assur based on it giving the appearance of wrongdoing, it is even assur to be done in private as well. If so, how would **B" S** allow the ladder to be moved in the reshus hayachid!? **A: Rav's** Halacha is actually a machlokes among Tanna'im. We find a Braisa where the **T" K** says such an act may be done in private, and **R' Elazar** and **R' Shimon** say that it may not be done in public or private.
 - **Another version** says that **R' Chanan bar Ami** said, the machlokes in our Mishna is only when it is done in the reshus hayachid. In that case **B" S** say it is assur because they hold of **R' Yehuda in the name of Rav**, and **B" H** say it is mutar because they do not hold of him. However, they would both agree that it may not be done in reshus harabim.
 - **Q:** Can it be that **Rav** follows **B" S** (which would be unlikely since we don't pasken like them)? It must be that **Rav** understood **B" H** to hold that such an act would be assur in private as well, and he would disagree with **R' Chanan's** understanding of the machlokes!? **A: R' Chanan** had a Tanna (from the Braisa quoted above) to follow, who held that such an act can be done in private, even though it cannot be done in public.
- In a Braisa, **R' Shimon ben Elazar** states the machlokes differently. He says that **B" S** and **B" H** both allow moving the ladder from one birdhouse to the next. However, **B" S** don't allow returning the ladder after its use is done, whereas **B" H** even allow that. The Braisa continues, that **R' Yehuda** says, this is only true when dealing with a ladder used for birdhouses. However, with regard to using a regular ladder, all would agree it may not be moved at all. **R' Dosa** says one may tilt a ladder from one compartment to the next. **Others** say in the name of **R' Dosa**, that a ladder may even be walked over to the next compartment.
 - **R' Chiya's** sons once returned from the village and **R' Chiya** asked them whether they paskened any matters when they were there. They said they were asked regarding moving a regular ladder to a birdhouse, and they allowed it. **R' Chiya** told them that they must return and prohibit what they had permitted.
 - **R' Chiya's** sons held that since **R' Yehuda** in the Braisa says that all agree regarding a regular ladder, it must be that the **T" K** holds they do argue regarding a regular ladder, and that **B" H** allow it. However, this is an erred interpretation. From the fact that the **T" K** says we may move a ladder "from one birdhouse to another", instead of saying "we may move a ladder to a birdhouse", it must mean that he is discussing a ladder meant for birdhouses.

- **R' Chiya's** sons felt that if it referred to a ladder meant for birdhouses, the **T"K** would have said, "a ladder of a birdhouse".
- **Others** said, that **R' Chiya's** sons told him, we were asked regarding tilting a regular ladder from one compartment to another, and we allowed it. **R' Chiya** told them that they must return and prohibit what they had permitted.
 - **R' Chiya's** sons thought that when **R' Dosa** allowed tilting a ladder, he was discussing a regular ladder (he came to argue on **R' Yehuda** who only allowed a birdhouse ladder). However, this is an erred understanding. **R' Dosa** is actually coming to be machmir on **R' Yehuda**, who allowed moving of a birdhouse ladder. **R' Dosa** says that even such a ladder may only be tilted, not moved.

AVAL MATEIHU MEI'CHALON L'CHALON...

- **Q:** From our Mishna we see that when it comes to matters affecting Simchas Yom Tov (like getting birds to eat), **B"S** are more machmir (they do not allow moving the ladder), and **B"H** are more meikel (they do allow moving the ladder). However, the last Mishna said that **B"S** allow one to dig up earth to cover the blood of a bird or a chaya, so that he can shecht them on Yom Tov, and **B"H** do not allow it. We see that **B"S** are meikel and **B"H** are machmir!? **A: R' Yochanan** said, we must flip the shitos (of either our Mishna, according to Rashi, or the previous Mishna, according to other Rishonim) so that **B"S** and **B"H** remain consistent in their views.
 - **Q:** Why must we reverse the shitos? It may be that **B"S** are truly more machmir, and the only reason they are meikel in the previous Mishna is because the person had a shovel dug into the earth from before Yom Tov!? It may also be that **B"H** are truly more machmir, and the only reason they allow the carrying of the ladder is because the fact that he carries it to the birdhouse shows to all that he is using the ladder for a permitted purpose!? Based on this, why did **R' Yochanan** say that we must reverse the shitos? **A: R' Yochanan** must have said his statement on another contradiction. A Mishna says that **B"S** do not allow one to take a bird from a birdhouse on Yom Tov, unless it was handled before Yom Tov, and in that way prepared for Yom Tov. **B"H** allow one to prepare the birds by simply pointing at them and verbally preparing them for Yom Tov. We see that **B"S** are machmir and **B"H** are meikel for Simchas Yom Tov even though they each hold the opposite in the case of shechting a chaya or bird on Yom Tov! This must be what **R' Yochanan** was referring to when he said that the shitos must be reversed.
 - **Q:** Why must we reverse the shitos? It may be that **B"S** are truly more machmir, and the only reason they are meikel in the previous Mishna is because the person had a shovel dug into the earth from before Yom Tov!? It may also be that **B"H** are truly more machmir, and the only reason they allow verbal preparation is because they hold that it is sufficient to remove the issur of muktzeh!? **A: R' Yochanan** must have said his statement on another contradiction. A Mishna says that **B"S** do not allow one on Yom Tov to take a keili used for pounding wheat (which may not be done on Yom Tov) to use for pounding meat, and **B"H** do allow it. We see that **B"S** are machmir and **B"H** are meikel for Simchas Yom Tov even though they each hold the opposite in the case of shechting a chaya or bird on Yom Tov! This must be what **R' Yochanan** was referring to when he said that the shitos must be reversed.
 - **Q:** Why must we reverse the shitos? It may be that **B"S** are truly more machmir, and the only reason they are meikel in the previous Mishna is because the person had a shovel dug into the earth from before Yom Tov!? It may also be that **B"H** are truly more machmir, and the only reason they allow using the keili is because they hold that since it has the status of a keili, it does not become muktzeh!?