



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

### Beitzah Daf Hey

- Regarding the 2 days of Rosh Hashanah, **Rav** and **Shmuel** both say that an egg laid on the first day may not be eaten on the second day (because the days of Rosh Hashanah were enacted as one long kedusha).
  - We see that the enactment was made as one kedusha (not as 2 days out of doubt) from a Mishna. The Mishna says that even when Rosh Chodesh was determined by Beis Din based on witnesses, they instituted that if the witnesses arrived after the time of Mincha on the 30<sup>th</sup> day of Elul, after the Levi'im had already sung the weekday shir for the afternoon Tamid, that they would not accept the witnesses anymore, and would make the next day be Rosh Chodesh (and Rosh Hashanah). That meant that there were 2 days of Rosh Hashanah that year (they would have to keep the 30<sup>th</sup> day as Yom Tov in case witnesses came at some point that day, and they continued keeping it as Yom Tov even after the time of Mincha arrived). We see that this was enacted as a 2 day Yom Tov, but not because of doubt as to which day was correct.
  - **Rabbah** said, from the time of the enactment of **R' Yochanan ben Zakkai** with his beis din, an egg laid on the first day is mutar to be eaten on the second day. After the Churban, **R' Yochanan ben Zakkai** again accepted witnesses even after the time for Mincha.
    - **Q: Abaye** asked, we said that **Rav** and **Shmuel** both said that it may not be eaten!? **A: Rabbah** answered, that doesn't prevent **R' Yochanan ben Zakkai** from arguing with them!
      - **Rav** and **Shmuel** would say that they were discussing the Halacha for people in Chutz La'aretz, and **R' Yochanan ben Zakkai** was discussing the Halacha for people of Eretz Yisrael.
  - **R' Yosef** said that even after the time of **R' Yochanan's** enactment, an egg laid on the first day may not be eaten on the second day. The reason is that the original 2-day enactment was made by a number of **Rabanan**, and such an enactment cannot be repealed unless another group of **Rabanan** were to reverse it.
    - We see that this is the only way to reverse a prior enactment from: 1) The pasuk says that Hashem told Moshe after Matan Torah, to tell the Yidden that they may return to their wives. Now, the Yidden were already told that they can't be with their wives for 3 days, so automatically they could return after that time. Why the need to specifically tell them? We see that an enactment made must be reversed by another "group". 2) Even if you say that the previous pasuk was stated to tell the Yidden to do the mitzvah of "onah", another pasuk says, that after the shofar blows, the Yidden we allowed to go on Har Sinai. Now, the pasuk had already said that they may not go on the mountain for as long as the Shechina rested upon it. Why the need to specifically permit it later? It must be because an enactment made must be reversed by another "group"; 3) Even if you want to say that that only teaches for a case of D'Oraisa, a Mishna tells how a Rabbinic enactment (i.e. the bringing of the fruit of the 4<sup>th</sup> year of a tree to Yerushalayim, without the option to redeem it and bring the money in its place) was reversed based on a later group of **Rabanan**.
    - **R' Yosef** explained, if you will think that the egg is now mutar on the second day because **R' Yochanan** reversed the earlier enactment, that is not accurate. **R'**

**Yochanan** only reversed the enactment of not accepting witnesses after Mincha, he did not reverse the enactment of the egg being assur.

- **Q: Abaye** asked, there was no separate enactment on eggs! The status of the egg was dependent on the enactment of accepting witnesses!?
- **R' Ada** and **R' Shalman** said that even after **R' Yochanan's** enactment the egg is assur on the second day. For even though at this time the 2 days are no longer based on a reason for them to be considered one long kedusha, we must be concerned that when the Beis Hamikdash is very soon built, people will not realize that the 2 days will then have the status of one long kedusha and the egg will therefore be assur. To prevent this confusion from happening, the egg is assur on the second day Rosh Hashanah in today's times as well.
  - **Q:** Based on this concern, we should also not change the allowable time for accepting witnesses!? **A:** Only Beis Din accepts the witnesses and there is no concern that they will make that mistake.
- **Rava** said, even after **R' Yochanan's** enactment the egg is assur on the second day. **R' Yochanan** only said that we accept the witnesses after the time for Mincha (which makes that day the 1<sup>st</sup> of Tishrei). However, **R' Yochanan** would agree that even then, that day and the next are treated as Yom Tov. Therefore, the egg would remain assur.
- **Rava** said, we pasken like **Rav** in all these 3 cases that were mentioned (**Rav** said that when Shabbos and Yom Tov are on consecutive days, an egg laid on the first day is assur on the second day; **Rav** allowed an egg that was laid on the first day of Yom Tov in chutz la'arezt to be eaten on the second day of Yom Tov; **Rav** said that an egg laid on the first day of Rosh Hashanah may not be eaten on the second day of Rosh Hashanah).