



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

### Beitzah Daf Gimmel

- **Q:** It is understandable why the others did not say **R' Nachman's** answer, because of the question that he was left with (i.e. why not say the machlokes regarding the chicken and the egg). It is also understandable why the others did not answer like **Rabbah**, because they do not hold of the issue of "hachana". However, why didn't **R' Yosef** answer like **R' Yitzchak** (that it is a gezeirah to prevent drinking juice that flowed from a fruit on Yom Tov)? **A:** He holds that an egg (which is a solid) would not be confused with juice (which is a liquid), and therefore, a gezeirah would not have been instituted.
  - **Q:** Why didn't **R' Yitzchak** answer like **R' Yosef**? **A:** He says that eggs are more comparable to juices, because they are both enveloped in another substance (the juice in the fruit, and the egg in the chicken). This is different than **R' Yosef's** comparison to the fruit itself, which is not enveloped in anything at all.
- We can determine that **R' Yochanan** also held like **R' Yitzchak**, because he posed the following contradiction of **R' Yehuda**, from one Mishna to another. A Mishna says that juice that flows from fruit by itself on Shabbos is assur to drink. **R' Yehuda** says, if the fruit was meant to eaten, the juice is mutar (it will not lead him to squeeze the fruits, because they were meant for eating). If they were meant for squeezing, the juice is assur. **R' Yochanan** said, we see from here that **R' Yehuda** holds that food separated from food meant to be eaten is mutar. A second Mishna says, that **R' Yehuda** says that an egg born on the first day of Rosh Hashanah may be eaten on the second day of Rosh Hashanah (because he considers them to be 2 separate kedushos). This would seem to mean that **R' Yehuda** would say it is assur to eat the egg on the first day. **R' Yochanan** said that we must change the views of the first Mishna so that **R' Yehuda** actually says what the **T"K** said, and visa-versa. Now, from the fact that **R' Yochanan** said that these statements contradict each other, it must be that he holds that the reason to say the egg is assur on Yom Tov would be because it is a gezeirah to prevent one from drinking juice that flowed by itself from a fruit. That would be the reason **R' Yehuda** would say it is assur to eat the egg on the first day of Rosh Hashanah. Yet, we see that he does not apply this gezeirah even in regard to fruit itself, when it is not likely to lead to squeezing a fruit. Therefore, he would surely allow one to eat an egg that was laid on Yom Tov. We see that **R' Yochanan** holds of the reason of **R' Yitzchak**.
  - **Ravina** answered the contradiction, that in the second Mishna **R' Yehuda** is saying to the **Rabanan**, according to me one may even eat the egg on the first day, but even according to you, at least agree that he can eat the egg on the second day, because the days of Rosh Hashanah are 2 separate days! The **Rabanan** respond, that they hold that the 2 days of Rosh Hashanah are one kedusha, and the egg may therefore not be eaten on either day.
  - **Ravina the son of R' Ulla** said, the second Mishna is discussing a chicken that is intended to be left alive to lay eggs. The reason **R' Yehuda** holds that the egg may not be eaten is because he holds of muktzeh.
- **Q:** A Braisa says, an egg laid on Shabbos or Yom Tov may not be moved for any reason, but may be covered with a keili to protect it. In a case of doubt, the egg is assur. If it gets mixed up with 1,000 other eggs, they are all assur. Now, according to **Rabbah** it would make sense why the Braisa says that in a case of doubt it is assur, because according to **Rabbah** it is a safek D'Oraisa (he learns out the Halacha of hachana from a pasuk). However, according to **R' Yosef** and **R' Yitzchak**, it would only be a safek D'Rabanan (they hold it is only assur as a gezeirah) and should

therefore be mutar!? **A:** That part of the Braisa is discussing the case where the egg comes from a chicken that is a safek tereifah, which is a safek D'Oraisa, and is therefore assur.

- **Q:** The latter part of the Braisa says, that if the egg gets mixed with other eggs, they all become assur. If the Braisa is discussing a safek whether the egg was laid on or before Yom Tov, it would make sense why all the eggs in the mixture become assur, since the safek egg is destined to become mutar after Yom Tov, and the Halacha is that anything that is assur, but is destined to become mutar, makes the items that it gets mixed in assur as well (for as long as it is assur). However, if the safek of the Braisa is a safek treifah, it is not destined to become mutar, and therefore should not make a mixture assur as long as the mixture contains a majority of mutar items!? Don't try and answer that a treifa egg will not become batul since it is considered significant (a "davar chashuv"), because an egg is only sometimes sold by the piece, and there is a machlokes whether an item that is only sometimes sold by the piece becomes batul or not. According to the view that it does become batul, why does the egg of the Braisa make the entire mixture assur!? **A: R' Pappa** said, the Tanna of the Braisa follows the view of another Braisa that an item which is even only sometimes counted will make an entire mixture assur even if the item itself is only assur D'Rabanan, and surely if it is assur D'Oraisa. This other Braisa brings a machlokes between **R' Meir** and **R' Yehuda**, where **R' Yehuda** says, that **R' Yehoshua** says, that dried figs of terumah D'Rabanan that were placed at the mouth of a keili, and there are even 300 times this amount of figs in mouths of other keilim, the terumah will not become batul (even though it is only D'Rabanan), because the mouths of the keilim are considered items which are counted, and therefore do not become batul. The Tanna of the first Braisa mentioned will hold like **R' Yehoshua** as explained by **R' Yehuda**.