



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

Succah Daf Ches

- **R' Yochanan** said, if one makes a succah that is round like an oven, if it is large enough for 24 people to be able to sit around its inside perimeter, it is valid. If not, it is passul.
 - **Q:** Presumably this would have to follow the view of **Rebbi** (because his view that a minimum succah needs to be 4x4 amos seems to be the largest required measurement)? But he doesn't seem to follow **Rebbi** for the following reason. The average person needs an amah of space to sit. Now, we have a general rule that a circle's circumference is 3 times its diameter. According to **Rebbi**, who says a minimum succah must be 4x4 amos, that would mean that the circle encompassing this 4 amah diameter would only have a 12 amah circumference (not the 24 stated by **R' Yochanan**)!? **A:** The 3:1 ratio is only true when dealing with the diameter of a circle. **Rebbi**, however, is not discussing a circle, he is discussing a 4x4 amah square, whose perimeter will be more than the circumference of a circle with a diameter of 4 amos.
 - **Q:** The perimeter of a square is 25% (of the new total, or 1/3 of the original number) greater than the largest circle that fits within that square. Based on that, the perimeter of **Rebbi's** square should be 16 amos. If so, why does **R' Yochanan** require 24 amos? **A:** **R' Yochanan** requires the circle to be large enough to fit a 4x4 amah succah within the circle. The circumference of that circle is more than the 16 amah perimeter of the square.
 - **Q:** The diagonal of a 4 amah square (which is the diameter of the circle that encompasses the square) is equal to 5.6 amos. The circumference of the circle is 3x that, or 16.8 amos. So why does **R' Yochanan** require 24 amos? **A:** He was not being exact and therefore gave an approximation.
 - **Q:** He is too far off to say that the difference is based on the fact that he was just not being exact!? **A:** **Mar Kashisha the son of R' Chisda** said, a person does not need a full amah to sit. A person needs only 2/3 of an amah to sit. If so, when **R' Yochanan** says there must be room for 24 people to sit, that means there must be a circle with a circumference of 16 amos.
 - **Q:** We have explained that a 4x4 square needs a circle of 16.8 amos to encircle it, so why does **R' Yochanan** say that a round succah of 16 amos will be valid!? **A:** He was not being precise when he said 16 amos.
 - **Q:** We would accept that answer when the imprecision results in a chumra, not when it leads to a kulla!? **A:** **R' Assi** said, really a person needs an amah of space to sit. However, **R' Yochanan** did not mean that there must be enough room for 24 people to sit *inside* the circle. He meant that there must be room for 24 people to sit on the *outside* of the circle (which means the circle itself only needs a diameter of 6 amos, which is approximately what we said the diagonal of the 4x4 square will be equal to).
 - **Q:** This would mean that **R' Yochanan** requires a circumference of 18 amos, and we have proven earlier that only 16.8 is needed!? **A:** Now we can say that **R' Yochanan** was simply being imprecise (because it is not far off, and he is making a chumra).

- The **Rabanan of Kisri** say that the circumference of a circle is 50% larger than the perimeter of the square that it encircles. Therefore, the 4x4 square, with its 16 amah perimeter, is encircled in a circle with a circumference of 24 amos.
 - The Gemara says that we see that this is erred math, and therefore can't be the reason of **R' Yochanan**.
- **R' Levi in the name of R' Meir** said, regarding the 2 huts used by potters (an outer hut leading to an inner hut, where the inner hut was used for living and the outer hut was used for working), the inner hut may not be used for a succah (it is not made special for Succos and is not noticeable that he is staying in it for the mitzvah of succah) and is chayuv to have a mezuzah, but the outer hut may be used for succah (since he doesn't typically live in it, when he does so, it is apparent that it is being done for the mitzvah of succah), and need not have a mezuzah.
 - **Q:** The outer hut should need a mezuzah just by the fact that it is a gatehouse to the inner hut!? **A:** Since the huts are not considered to be permanent structures, the outer hut will not get the status of a gatehouse.
- A Braisa says, the succah of goyim (built for the summer months), of women, of animals, of Kutim, and a succah of any kind, are valid to be used on Succos provided that they are covered "properly".
 - **R' Chisda** explains, "covered properly" means that they are covered by a thick layer of s'chach which makes it obvious that they were built for shade, not just for privacy.
 - **Q:** What does "a succah of any kind" come to include? **A:** It comes to include the list of succos in another Braisa, that are valid as well. The Braisa says, the succah of shepherds, of fig watchers, of city watchmen, of fruit watchers, and a "succah of any kind" are valid to be used on Succos provided that they are covered "properly".
 - **R' Chisda** explains, "covered properly" means that they are covered by a thick layer of s'chach which makes it obvious that they were built for shade, not just for privacy.
 - **Q:** What does "a succah of any kind" come to include? **A:** It comes to include the list of succos in the first Braisa.
 - The Tanna of the first Braisa considers his list to be superior, because they are more permanent structures. The Tanna of the second Braisa considers his list to be superior, because they are used by people who are chayuv in the mitzvah of succah.