



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

### Succah Daf Mem Gimmel

#### GEMARA

- **Q:** Why is it assur to handle the lulav in the Beis Hamikdash on Shabbos? At most, the lulav is muktzeh, which is only an issur D'Rabanan (which is not even a gezeirah which prevents possible violation of an issur D'Oraisa), and there is a mitzvah D'Oraisa to shake the lulav on Shabbos as well!? **A: Rabbah** explains, there is a gezeirah that one may carry the lulav to an expert who can show him how to shake it, and thereby carry it 4 amos in reshus harabim. This is the same reason that we don't blow the shofar on Rosh Hashanah that falls on a Shabbos, and the reason we don't read megillah on Purim that falls on a Shabbos.
  - **Q:** If so, why do we shake the lulav on Shabbos when it is the first day of Succos? **A:** The **Rabanan** had instituted that when the first day of Succos falls on Shabbos, the people should shake the lulav in their homes (because of the dangers described in the Mishna), therefore it would not lead to carrying in reshus harabim.
    - **Q:** Why did they allow the lulav to be taken on Shabbos before the **Rabanan** instituted that it should be taken at home? **A:** With regard to the first day of Succos, where there is a mitzvah D'Oraisa to take the lulav everywhere, the **Rabanan** were not goizer to stop the taking of the lulav. With regard to the rest of the days of Succos, where the mitzvah of lulav only applies at the Mikdash, the **Rabanan** were goizer on Shabbos that the lulav should not be taken.
    - **Q:** If so, even today, after the Churban, the **Rabanan** should not be goizer and the lulav should be taken on Shabbos!? **A:** In Bavel we are not sure when the first day of Yom Tov is (which is why the institution of 2 days of Yom Tov began) and therefore we can't override Shabbos, since the day we think is Yom Tov may actually not be Yom Tov.
    - **Q:** In Eretz Yisrael the taking of the lulav on the first day should override Shabbos!? **A:** This is correct. Even after the Churban, the people of Eretz Yisrael take the lulav on the first day of Succos that falls on Shabbos.
- **Q:** How do we know that D'Oraisa the taking of the lulav must be done everywhere (even not in the Mikdash)? **A:** A Braisa says, the word "ulikachtem" teaches that every person has a chiyuv to shake the lulav. "Lachem" teaches that it may not be borrowed or stolen. "Bayom" teaches that it must be done even on Shabbos. "Rishon" teaches that it must be done everywhere, even when not by the Mikdash. "**HA**rishon" teaches that this overrides Shabbos only on the *first* day of Succos.
  - **Q:** The only issur associated with taking a lulav on Shabbos is that it may be muktzeh. We need a pasuk to allow muktzeh (which is only D'Rabanan)!? **A: Rava** said, the pasuk is necessary according to **R' Eliezer** in a Braisa who says that even the preparatory acts for the lulav, which are an issur D'Oraisa to do on Shabbos (e.g. cutting the lulav from the tree, tying the minim together), also override Shabbos, based on the pasuk of "bayom".
    - The **Rabanan** who argue on **R' Eliezer** (and prohibit such preparatory acts on Shabbos) say that "bayom" teaches that the mitzvah of lulav may only be performed by day, not by night. **R' Eliezer** learns this restriction from the pasuk that says "shivas **yamim**". The **Rabanan** say that this pasuk can't teach that because we would learn "yamim" from the word "yamim" stated regarding the mitzvah of succah, that just as succah must be performed by day and night, the same would be for lulav.

- This halacha of succah is learned out via a gezeirah shava (on the word “teishvu”) from the days of “Miluim”. Just as there it was day and night, so too succah is day and night.

#### ARAVAH SHIV’AH KEITZAD

- **Q:** Why does the aravah process (bringing them and having the Kohanim circle the Mizbe’ach with them) override Shabbos? **A: R’ Yochanan** said, we allow this to publicize that this process is a mitzvah D’Oraisa (it is not written in the Torah, but was taught to us via a Halacha L’Moshe MiSinai).
  - **Q:** Lulav should override Shabbos for this reason as well. For it too is not fully described in the Torah!? **A:** Lulav does not override Shabbos because of the gezeirah of **Rabbah** (that one may come to carry it in the reshus harabim).
    - **Q:** Why don’t we have that same gezeirah for the aravah process? **A:** The aravos are brought by the messengers of Beis Din and the process is done by the Kohanim (neither group of which we have to be concerned will carry or need to go to an expert to learn). Lulav, on the other hand, is a mitzvah performed by all.
    - **Q:** If so, why does the aravah process override Shabbos only on the last day of Succos? **A:** If it overrode Shabbos on every day of Succos, people would consider this process important and lulav unimportant.
    - **Q:** Why didn’t they say that it overrides Shabbos only on the first day of Succos (like lulav)? **A:** People would think that it is lulav that is overriding Shabbos, and aravah is merely accompanying the lulav process, and that is why it overrides Shabbos.
    - **Q:** Why is it the 7<sup>th</sup> day that was chosen to allow Shabbos to be overridden when it falls on that day? **A:** The **Rabanan** chose the most noticeable days, which are the first and last. Since (as explained) it can’t be the first day, they instituted that it be the last day.
    - **Q:** For the same reason we should allow this to be done on Shabbos after the Churban as well!? **A:** In Bavel we are not sure of the dates, and therefore we can’t override Shabbos, since the day we think is the 7<sup>th</sup> day may actually not be the 7<sup>th</sup> day.
    - **Q:** In Eretz Yisrael the taking of the aravos on the 7<sup>th</sup> day should override Shabbos!? **A: Bar Hedya** said, the 7<sup>th</sup> day of Succos can never fall out on a Shabbos. **A2: Ravin** said, it can fall on Shabbos, but the aravah process would not override Shabbos after the Churban.
      - **Q:** Why does it not override Shabbos!? **A: R’ Yosef** said, the mitzvah of the aravah process is not simply taking an aravah, it is the standing up of the aravos around the Mizbe’ach, which obviously can’t be done today.
      - **Q: Abaye** asked, our Mishna groups lulav with aravah, presumably teaching that just as taking the lulav is the mitzvah, the taking of the aravah is the mitzvah as well!? **A: R’ Yosef** said, make no such presumption. It may be that the mitzvah of lulav is accomplished by its taking and the mitzvah of aravah is done by its standing around the Mizbe’ach.
      - **Q: Abaye** asked, a Mishna says that every day of Succos the Kohanim circled the Mizbe’ach one time, and on the 7<sup>th</sup> day they circled it 7 times. Presumably the Mishna is referring to their circling of the Mizbe’ach with the aravos. We see that the aravos were held in the hand and walked around the Mizbe’ach!? **A: R’ Yosef** answered, the Mishna is referring to their walking around with their lulav.
        - **Q: Abaye** asked, **R’ Nachman in the name of Rabbah bar Avuha** said they circled the Mizbe’ach with the aravos!? **A: R’ Yosef** responded, **R’ Nachman** said that, but I disagree.

- We find that **R' Elazar** says they circled with their lulav, and **R' Shmuel bar Nosson in the name of R' Chanina**, and **R' Nachman in the name of Rabbah bar Avuha** said they circled the Mizbe'ach with the aravos.
- **Q: Abaye** asked, a Braisa says that once, when the 7<sup>th</sup> day of Succos fell on a Shabbos, the Baisusin took the aravos on Friday and placed them under rocks to try and prevent the Kohanim from waving them the next day. From this Braisa we see that the aravos were not just stood up, rather they were waved!? **A: TEYUFTA.**
- **Q:** Based on this, the people of Eretz Yisroel should be allowed to override Shabbos even after the Churban with the taking of the aravah on the 7<sup>th</sup> day of Succos!? **A:** The **Rabanan** wanted all of Klal Yisrael to follow one set of halachos. Since the people outside Eretz Yisrael can't override Shabbos (because they don't know the dates for certain), the people in Eretz Yisrael also can't override Shabbos for the aravah process.
  - **Q:** The people of Eretz Yisrael override Shabbos for the mitzvah of lulav when the first day falls on Shabbos and yet the people of Bavel don't!? **A:** They don't override Shabbos for lulav either.
  - **Q:** There is one Mishna that says that when the first day of Succos fell on Shabbos the people would bring their lulavim to the Beis Hamikdash on Friday. Another Mishna says they would bring it to shul. Presumably the difference between the Mishnayos is that the second Mishna refers to after the Churban. We see that they still overrode Shabbos for the mitzvah of lulav!? **A:** Both Mishnayos are discussing when the Beis Hamikdash stood. The second Mishna is discussing the people who lived far from the Har Habayis and could not go there on Shabbos. They would bring their lulavim to shul.