



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

### Succah Daf Chuf Ches

- A Braisa says, **R' Eliezer** once spent Shabbos in the Upper Galil and was asked 30 questions regarding the halachos of succah. He answered 12, and responded to the other 18 "I have not heard an answer". **R' Yose the son of R' Yehuda** says that he answered 18 and said regarding the other 12 "I have not heard an answer". They asked **R' Eliezer**, "You only pasken on questions that you have heard an answer from your rabbei'im"? **R' Eliezer** answered, "You are forcing me to explain my conduct: I was always first in the Beis Medrash, I never even napped in the Beis Medrash, I was always last to leave the Beis Medrash, I never engaged in idle chatter, (all these qualities leading to the conclusion that he never missed a word that his rabbei'im said), and I never repeated a halacha that I did not hear from my rabbei'im".
- They said about **R' Yochanan ben Zakkai**: he never spoke idle chatter, he never went 4 amos without learning Torah or wearing tefillin, he was always first to the Beis Medrash, he never even took a nap in the Beis Medrash, he never thought of Torah in dirty alleyways, he was always last to leave the Beis Medrash, no one ever saw him sitting idly because he was always sitting and learning, he would always be the one to open the door and greet the talmidim, he never repeated a halacha that he did not hear from his rabbei'im, and he never said "it's time to stop learning" except for Erev Pesach (so that they go home and put the children to sleep) and Erev Yom Kippur (so that they go home and eat). His talmid **R' Eliezer**, conducted himself by following these ways as well.
  - A Braisa says, **Hillel Hazakein** had 80 talmidim: 30 were so great that they were worthy to have the Shechina rest on them as it did on Moshe, 30 of them were so great that they were worthy to have the sun stop for them as it did for Yehoshua, and the remaining 20 were somewhere in between. The greatest of them was **Yonason ben Uziel** and the smallest of them was **R' Yochanan ben Zakkai**. It was said about **R' Yochanan ben Zakkai** that he was an expert on all of chumash, mishna, gemara, halachos l'Moshe MiSinai, midrashim, the drashos of the Torah, the drashos of the Rabanan, kal v'chomers, gezeirah shavas, astronomy, gematriyos, the talk of malachim, sheidim and palm trees, the meshalim of launderers and foxes (used in giving mussar), and a "great thing" (the workings of the merkava) and a "small thing" (the questions of **Abaye** and **Rava**). Now, if the smallest of the talmidim was this great, how much more so was the greatest of the talmidim! It was said about **Yonason ben Uziel**, that when he learned Torah, any bird that flew over him would be burned immediately.

### MISHNA

- If one sat with his head and most of his body in the succah, but with his table in the house, **B"S** say it is passul and **B"H** say it is valid. **B"H** said, it once happened that the Elders of **B"S** and **B"H** went to visit **R' Yochanan ben Hachoranis**, and they saw him sitting in this setup in his succah and they didn't say anything to him (suggesting that all agreed this was valid)! **B"S** responded, actually the Elders of **B"S** did respond to him and said, if you have always sat in a succah like this, you have never been yotzeh the mitzvah of succah!
- Women, slaves, and minors are all patur from the mitzvah of succah. However, a minor who does not need his mother's help is chayuv in the mitzvah of succah.
  - It once happened that **Shammai Hazaken's** daughter in law gave birth to a boy (on or before Succos), and **Shammai** removed the roof from on top of her bed and placed s'chach there so that the baby should sleep in a succah.

## GEMARA

- **Q:** How do we know that women and slaves are patur from succah? **A:** A Braisa says, if the pasuk would say “ezrach” (in the pasuk of “kol ha’ezrach b’Yisrael yeishvu basuccos”), that would mean to include even women. When the pasuk says “**ha’**ezrach”, it comes to exclude women. The word “kol” comes to include minors in the mitzvah of succah.
  - **Q:** A Braisa regarding Yom Kippur says “**ha’**ezrach” comes to include women in the mitzvah of fasting, because “ezrach” alone would have meant only men!? **A: Rabbah** said, the halacha is actually a halacha L’Moshe MiSinai, and the pasuk is only an asmachta.
    - **Q:** Which is the halacha and which is the drasha from the pasuk? **Q2:** Why is a halacha L’Moshe MiSinai or a pasuk needed altogether? Women are clearly patur from succah because it is a mitzvas assei shehazman gramma, and they are chayuv to fast on Yom Kippur because women are chayuv in all negative commandments!? **A: Abaye** said, the halacha of succah is the halacha L’Moshe MiSinai. Without it, we would think that the drasha of “teishvu k’ein taduru” teaches that husband and wife must live in the succah together, as they do in their house. The halacha therefore teaches that women are patur from succah. **A2: Rava** said, we would think that women are chayuv in succah via a gezeirah shava from Pesach (“chamisha assar”). The halacha therefore teaches that they are not chayuv.
      - **Q:** If succah is learned from the halacha L’Moshe MiSinai, what does the “**ha’**ezrach” teach? **A:** It teaches that geirim are chayuv in succah as well.
      - **Q:** Why is a pasuk necessary to teach that women are chayuv to fast on Yom Kippur? **A:** It is needed to teach that they are included in the mitzvah of adding some fasting time to the day of Yom Kippur (by beginning early and ending late). That is not a negative commandment, and therefore is a mitzvas assei shehazman gramma.
  - **Q:** The Braisa says that “kol” comes to include minors, but our Mishna said that minors are patur!? **A:** The Mishna is discussing a minor who is still young and need not be taught to keep the mitzvos (he still needs his mother’s help), and the Braisa is discussing a minor who is older, and therefore must be taught to keep the mitzvos.
    - **Q:** Such a minor is only chayuv D’Rabanan, so how can it be learned from a pasuk!? **A:** The pasuk is only an asmachta.

## KATAN SHE’EINO TZARICH L’IMO...

- **Q:** What does it mean that a child does not need his mother’s help? **A: R’ Yanai’s** yeshiva explained that the child can go to the bathroom without needing his mother to wipe him. **R’ Shimon** said, the child wakes up and doesn’t call for his mother.
  - **Q:** Even older children call for their mother when they wake up!? **A:** It means he doesn’t call incessantly until she comes.

## MAASEH V’YALDA KALASO...

- **Q:** The story comes to contradict what was taught previously!? **A:** The Mishna is missing words and should say that **Shammai** is machmir and says that a minor is chayuv. The story is then brought as proof to that shitah of **Shammai**.

## MISHNA

- For the 7 days of Succos, one must treat his succah as his fixed residence and his house as his temporary residence.
- **Q:** At what point may one leave the succah because of rain? **A:** When it is raining hard enough to ruin his soup.
  - Being forced to leave the succah due to rain is like a slave who pours a cup of wine for his master, and he pours a pitcher of water on his face (to be explained by the Gemara).

## GEMARA

- A Braisa says, for the 7 days of Succos, one must treat his succah as his fixed residence and his house as his temporary residence. This is done by bringing one's nice utensils and cloths into the succah, and by eating, drinking, and spending time in the succah.
  - **Q:** How do we know that one must treat his succah as his fixed residence? **A:** A Braisa says, the pasuk says "teishvu", which we darshen to mean that one should dwell in the succah "k'ein taduru", as he lives in his house. The Braisa then says, this is done by bringing one's nice utensils and cloths into the succah, and by eating, drinking, and spending time in the succah, and by analyzing his learning in the succah.
    - **Q: Rava** said that learning chumash and Mishna should be done in the succah, but deeper analysis should be done out of the succah (where it is easier for him to concentrate)!? **A:** The Braisa refers to one who is reviewing something he already learned. **Rava** is referring to analyzing something deeply for the first time.
    - **Rava** said, cups may be left in a succah even after use, but eating utensils may not. Earthenware pails and wooden pails should be left outside the succah. An earthenware lamp may be brought into the succah. Others say that such a lamp should be left outside the succah as well. These rulings do not argue. A earthenware lamp may be left in a large succah, but not in a succah of minimum size (it is very noticeable and disgusting).