



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

Succah Daf Chuf Zayin

MISHNA

- **R' Eliezer** says, one is chayuv to eat 14 meals in the succah, one by day and one by night on each day of Succos. The **Chachomim** say there is no such obligation to eat a meal, except for the first night of Succos.
- **R' Eliezer** also said, if one missed eating a meal the first day of Succos, he may make up for that meal on the last day of Succos (on Shmini Atzeres). The **Chachomim** say, there is no make-up opportunity for missing a meal.

GEMARA

- **Q:** Why does **R' Eliezer** say that one must eat a meal every day and night of Succos? **A:** The pasuk says "teishvu", which teaches that one must dwell in a succah as he does in his home. Just like in a house one eats a meal every day and night, the same must be done in a succah.
 - The **Rabanan** say, the succah must be like his house: just like one has the choice to eat or not to eat when in his house, the same is true regarding eating on Succos in the succah.
 - **Q:** If so, there should also be no chiyuv to eat on the first night of Succos!? **A:** **R' Yochanan in the name of R' Shimon ben Yehotzadak** said, we learn a gezeirah shava on the word "chamisha assar" from Pesach. Just as one must eat on the first night of Pesach (as the pasuk says "ba'erev tochl'u matzos"), and after that time eating is only voluntary, so too eating on Succos is only a chiyuv on the first night and is voluntary thereafter.

V'OHD AMAR R' ELIEZER

- **Q:** **R' Eliezer** previously said that one must eat 14 meals in the succah, so how can he compensate for one of those meals by eating on Shmini Atzeres, which is a day on which it is assur to eat in the succah!? **A:** **R' Eliezer** changed his opinion to that of the **Rabanan** and held that one is only chayuv to eat a meal on the first night of Succos. Their machlokes is whether a missed meal can be made up at a later time.
 - **Q:** What does he eat on Shmini Atzeres as the make-up? It can't be that he eats bread for the make-up, because that is part of the seudah that is anyway required for the Yom Tov of Shmini Atzeres!? **A:** The make-up is had by eating special desserts.
 - The "apitrapess" of King Agripas asked **R' Eliezer**, "I, who typically only eat one meal a day, can I just eat that one meal and be patur from the second meal on Succos"? **R' Eliezer** responded, "Every day you eat many appetizers to increase your appetite. Eat some more appetizers so that you will be hungry enough to eat another meal."
 - The apitrapess then asked, "I, who has a wife in each of two cities, may I travel from succah to succah on Yom Tov (**R' Eliezer** says later that one may not change succos during Yom Tov). **R' Eliezer** said, "You may not, because I say that one who goes from one succah to another has been mevatel the first succah".
 - A Braisa says, **R' Eliezer** says, one may not leave one succah for another, and one may not build a succah on Chol Hamoed. The **Chachomim** say that one may leave a succah for another, and one may build a succah on Chol Hamoed. Both agree, that if a succah falls down, it may be rebuilt on Chol Hamoed.
 - **R' Eliezer** learns from the pasuk, "chag haSuccos taaseh lecha shivas yamim", that one must make a succah that is fit for 7 days, because one

may not leave one succah for another. The **Rabanan** learn the pasuk as teaching that one must have a succah for every day of Succos, and if he doesn't, he may build it for even one day of Succos.

- **Q:** It is obvious that a succah which fell may be rebuilt! It is the same succah and is not a new one!? **A:** We would think it is considered to be a new succah (which would be assur according to **R' Eliezer**). The Braisa teaches that it is considered to be the same succah.
- **R' Eliezer** says, just as one is only yotzeh the mitzvah of lulav when he uses a lulav that is his own (the pasuk says "lchem"), so too, one is only yotzeh the mitzvah of succah when he uses a succah that is his own (the pasuk says "lecha"). The **Chachomim** say that a succah need not be one's own succah, because the pasuk says "kol ha'eizrach b'Yisrael yeishvu basuccos", which teaches that even all of Klal Yisrael may sit in one succah.
 - The **Rabanan** say that the "lecha" written by succah teaches that one cannot be yotzeh with a stolen succah.
 - **R' Eliezer** says, "kol ha'eizrach" teaches that if one becomes a "ger" or an adult on succos, they are chayuv in the mitzvah of succah (even though he generally holds that one must use his succah for all 7 days).
 - The **Rabanan** say, there is no need to teach that, because one may build a new succah on Chol Hamoed.
- A Braisa says, **R' Illai** once went to visit his rebbi, **R' Eliezer**, on Yom Tov. **R' Eliezer** told him that he is not treating Yom Tov properly, because one is supposed to spend it rejoicing with his wife and family.
 - **Q: R' Yitzchak** said, that we learn from a pasuk in Melachim that one is supposed to visit his rebbi on Yom Tov!? **A:** He is supposed to go only if he can go and return to his family the same day.
- A Braisa says, **R' Eliezer** once spent Shabbos (presumably of Succos) in the succah of **Yochanan the son of R' Illai**. As the rays of the sun crept closer to them, **Yochanan** asked whether he may spread a sheet over the succah to block the sun (or whether that is prohibited on Shabbos because he is adding to a building, even though it is a temporary addition). **R' Eliezer** kept changing the subject to avoid answering the question. Finally, **Yochanan** went and put the sheet over the succah. **R' Eliezer** picked himself up and left the succah. The reason **R' Eliezer** didn't answer directly was because he never stated a halacha that he did not hear from his rabbei'im.
 - **Q:** How could **R' Eliezer** have gone to someone else's succah? **R' Eliezer** holds that one must remain in his own succah for all 7 days of Succos!? **A:** It was another Yom Tov (and they were sitting in a succah for comfort).
 - **Q: R' Eliezer** says one must remain home on Yom Tov!? **A:** It was a regular Shabbos, not a Yom Tov.
 - **Q:** Why couldn't **R' Eliezer** state the halacha based on a teaching that he did have from his rabbei'im? We have a Mishna where **R' Eliezer** says, a window shutter may be placed to close the window on Shabbos if the shutter is attached to the building and does not drag on the floor when it hangs (at that point it would be considered as part of the building already, not an addition). The **Chachomim** say, the shutter may be placed to close the window even if it is not attached at all. We see that **R' Eliezer** does not allow even a temporary addition to a building, and should therefore prohibit the placing of a sheet over a succah!? **A:** The cases are not comparable. In the case of the shutter, he is mevatel the shutter to the building, and it can therefore be said to be adding to the building. In the case of the succah, he is not mevatel the sheet, and it may therefore be mutar (since he is not adding to the succah).