



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

### Succah Daf Yud Zayin

#### MISHNA

- If the s'chach is placed 3 tefachim from the wall (leaving an empty space), the succah is passul.
- If there is a hole in the roof of a house and one puts valid s'chach over that hole, if there are 4 amos between the wall and the opening with the s'chach, it is passul. The same would hold true for porches in a courtyard, over which s'chach was placed. The same would be in a large succah where passul s'chach was placed near the walls and valid s'chach is placed in the center.

#### GEMARA

- **Q:** Why did the Mishna have to give 3 cases to illustrate the concept of dofen akuma? **A:** If we would just give the case of the house, we would say dofen akuma only applies there, because the walls are made for the house. However, the walls of the courtyard are not made for the porches and therefore maybe we would not say dofen akuma there. And, if we were to only say these two cases, we would think, only there do we say dofen akuma, because the space between the s'chach and the walls are filled with items that are not inherently passul as s'chach (the roof is made of wood, which is only passul because of ta'aseh v'lo min he'asuy). However, in the 3<sup>rd</sup> case where he placed inherently passul s'chach, maybe we would not say dofen akumah. That's why the Mishna says all 3 cases.
- **Rabbah** found the **Rabanan** saying in the name of **Rav** that an empty space of 3 tefachim makes the succah passul, and passul s'chach of 4 tefachim makes a succah passul. **Rabbah** asked them, you say that 3 tefachim of empty space makes a succah passul based on our Mishna. The same Mishna says that passul s'chach only makes a succah passul when it is 4 amos!? The **Rabanan** responded, **Rav and Shmuel** both say, our Mishna is discussing when the passul s'chach is on the side, and it works via dofen akuma. **Rabbah** said, I then asked them, if there was passul s'chach less than 4 tefachim next to empty space less than 3 tefachim, it would be valid. However, if one was to fill some of the empty space with passul s'chach, the succah would become passul (there would be more than 4 tefachim of passul s'chach). How can it be that empty space (which is more stringent in that a smaller amount of it makes the succah passul) would not make the succah passul, but placing passul s'chach there does make it passul? The **Rabanan** responded, that same question exists according to you when there is passul s'chach less than 4 amos next to an empty space less than 3 tefachim! **Rabbah** replied, according to me, when the passul s'chach is less than 4 amos, the requisite amount doesn't exist to make it passul (it's a size requirement, not based on theory). This won't combine with the empty space, because the size requirements are drastically different. However, according to you, the size of 4 tefachim is based on the theory that 4 tefachim of passul s'chach creates a separation of the valid s'chach on the succah. Since the empty space is based on the same theory, they should combine and make the succah passul!
  - **Q: Abaye** asked **Rabbah**, even according to you they should combine, because in a succah of minimum measurement, empty space and s'chach passul will each make the succah passul even if they are present in only 3 tefachim. Therefore, they have the same "shiur" and should combine!? **A: Rabbah** said, in that case the succah is passul because it lacks the minimum size necessary for a succah, not because of the size of the passul s'chach.

- **Q:** Why does he say that whenever things do not have the same minimum shiur, they cannot be combined? A Mishna says that different materials combine for the shiur of tumah, even though each type of material has its own distinct shiur!? **A: R' Shimon** explains that the case of the Mishna is different, because they all share the minimum size needed to become tamei though being sat upon by a zav, since even when just one square tefach, they are fit to be used as a patch for a donkey saddle.
- In Naharda'ah they said, **R' Yehuda in the name of Shmuel** said, passul s'chach in middle of the succah makes the succah passul even when just 4 tefachim. When it is at the succah wall, it is only passul when it is 4 amos. **Rav** said, in both cases it is only passul when it is 4 amos.
  - **Q:** The earlier Mishna said that that if one puts a 4 tefach board on a succah, it is valid. How would **Shmuel** explain this? **A:** He would say it is discussing when it is put on the side near the wall.
  - **Q:** A Braisa says, boards do not combine to make a succah passul, but **R' Meir** says that they do. According to the version of **Rav** that even in middle of the succah it is only a problem when the passul s'chach is 4 amos, this is understandable, because it refers to the boards combining to 4 amos. However, according to the version that says in middle it is passul when only 4 tefachim, how can this be explained? If they are already 4 tefachim, it is passul. If they are less than 4 tefachim, they are simply sticks, which clearly can't be a problem when combined!? **A:** The Braisa may be dealing with boards that are 4 tefachim wide (which **R' Meir** says is passul s'chach), and the issue being dealt with is whether they combine to 4 amos near the wall (where all agree it is not passul at less than 4 amos).
  - **Q:** A Braisa says, if one covered a succah with boards of 4 tefachim, **R' Meir** would agree that if in between each board of 4 tefachim there is a space of equal size, and that space is then filled with valid s'chach, the succah will be valid. According to the version that in middle of the succah it is passul at 4 tefachim, why is this a valid succah when there are boards of 4 tefachim in middle of the succah!? **A: R' Huna the son of R' Yehoshua** said, the Braisa is discussing a succah which is exactly 8 amos. At each end he placed a 4 tefach board, and then alternated between valid s'chach and a board toward the middle of the succah. The result is that the middle 8 tefachim of the succah is covered with valid s'chach. After taking into account dofen akuma, the middle 8 tefachim are the main part of this succah, and is large enough to create a valid succah.