



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

### Eirubin Daf Tzaddik Gimmel

- **Q: Rabbah bar Chanan** said to **Abaye**, we find the concept that a wall can cause an issur, regarding the case of a structure with a roof above half of it. In that case, the Braisa says that one may plant grapes under one of the halves and vegetation under the other half (because we view the end of the roof as if it creates a wall). However, if one would roof the remaining part of the structure, it would be assur to plant in this way. We see that building the roof creates an issur!? **A: Abaye** said, that is a case of removing a wall (by building the roof he removes the halachic wall) and that's why it creates an issur.
- **Q: Rava** sent a question to **Abaye**, we find a Braisa where a wall creates an issur. The Braisa says, one must simply move 4 amos away from planted grapes and is then allowed to plant vegetation. However, if from the grapes to the wall there is less than 12 amos, one may not plant vegetation!? **A: Abaye** said, the reason for that is not because the wall creates issur. It is because one does not plant within 4 amos to a wall (for fear it will weaken the wall). Therefore, to plant vegetation between grapes and a wall there must be 12 amos (4 amos near the grapes to allow space to service the vines, 4 amos of planting vegetation and 4 amos to leave empty near the wall).
- **R' Yehuda** said, if there are 3 karfafs adjacent to each other (3 people were traveling and enclosed an area around themselves for Shabbos, in which case the halacha is that each area cannot be larger than a beis sasayim for each person unless there are 3 people, which would give them the status of a caravan and would let them enclose as much space as they need), with the outer two larger than the middle (so that the middle is open in its entirety to each outer, but each outer has side walls like the case of the large chatzer adjacent to the small chatzer), and there is only one person in each karfaf, since each outer karfaf is considered to be in the middle karfaf as well (it is its "entranceway"), the middle karfaf is considered as if a caravan is there and may be as large as needed. However, if the middle is larger than the 2 outers, and there is one person in each area, it is not considered as if they are all in the middle karfaf, and therefore each karfaf may only be one beis sasayim.
  - **Q:** What would the halacha be if there were 2 people in the middle karfaf and one in each outer? We can say that because each outer is an extension of the middle one (it is the larger one and the outer is the smaller one), the 2 people from the middle should combine with the one on each side and should be considered a caravan of 3. Or, maybe we say that the 2 middle people should be viewed as going to separate outer karfafs, in which case there are not 3 people together!? **Q2:** If we say that we view them as going separately, what if each outer karfaf has 2 people and there is one person in the middle karfaf? In this case there are 3 whichever way he goes, so we should consider it a caravan. Or, maybe we say that because we don't know which way he will go, we cannot consider either one to be a caravan of 3!? **A:** The Gemara says that we pasken leniently with regard to both these questions.
- **R' Chisda** said, if a chatzer is elevated from another chatzer by 5 tefachim, and then a wall of 5 tefachim is added at the edge of that upper chatzer, it does not act as wall of 10 tefachim. To do so, the 10 tefachim must be made of 10 tefachim of elevation or a 10 tefach wall.
  - **Q:** A Braisa says, that in the case described by **R' Chisda** the chatzeiros must make separate eirubin and may not join into one. We see that it is a separation!? **A: Rava** said, **R' Chisda** would agree that the lower chatzer in this case is viewed as having a full 10-tefach wall on that side, and that is what the Braisa is referring to.
    - **Q:** If so, the lower chatzer should be allowed to only make an eiruv on its own, and the upper chatzer should not even be able to do that (because it should be viewed as being open in its entirety to the lower chatzer)!? **A: Rabbah bar Ulla**

said, the upper chatzer had walls on the side adjacent to the lower chatzer, but had an opening of 10 amos (at the opening there was 5 tefachim of elevation and 5 tefachim of wall). Therefore, it is not considered to be open in its entirety to the lower chatzer.

- **Q:** The end of the Braisa says that “if it is less than this (10 tefachim high) they must make one joint eiruv”. If it had partial walls, it should be able to choose whether to make a separate or joint eiruv!? **A: Rabbah the son of Rava** said, the case is that the lower chatzer is open in its entirety to the upper chatzer (the lower chatzer is narrower, with its width equal to the opening of the upper chatzer).
- **Q:** If so, the lower chatzer should only be make a joint eiruv, but the upper chatzer should be allowed to choose between making its own or making a joint eiruv! Why does the Braisa say that a joint eiruv must be made!? **A:** The Braisa is referring to the lower chatzer.
- **Mareimar** said that an elevation of 5 tefachim plus a wall of 5 tefachim do combine to act as a wall of 10 tefachim.
  - The Gemara paskens like **Mareimar**.
- **Q: R’ Hoshaya** asked, if new residents come into a chatzer on Shabbos (e.g. a wall between 2 chatzeiros fell, so the residents of each are now considered as being residents of each other now as well), does carrying become prohibited? **A: R’ Chisda** said, our Mishna says if the wall between a large and small chatzer fell down, carrying becomes prohibited in the small chatzer. Presumably this is even when the wall fell on Shabbos, and we see that it makes it assur!
  - **Rabbah** said, the Mishna may be discussing where the wall fell before Shabbos. **Abaye** said, it is not “may be”, rather the Mishna is *certainly* talking about where the wall fell before Shabbos, because you once asked **R’ Huna and R’ Yehuda** if the entranceway between 2 chatzeiros became blocked on Shabbos, does the joint eiruv become passul? You were told that since it began Shabbos as kosher, it remains permissible to carry.
- **Rav** says, if a wall between chatzeiros fell down on Shabbos, one may only carry within 4 amos. **Shmuel** says each chatzer may carry within its entire borders.
  - We find **Rav’s** shita from a story that happened. **Rav and Shmuel** were sitting in a chatzer and the wall between it and the next chatzer fell down. **Shmuel** instructed that a sheet be hung to separate the chatzeiros (for reasons of privacy). **Rav** turned away because he held it was assur to carry the sheet. **Rav** did not argue outright, because he was in **Shmuel’s** town and would not argue with him there, but he turned away so that people would not think that he agreed.