



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

Eiruvim Daf Tzaddik

- **Q: Rami bar Chama** asked, would the **Rabanan** (who say that each roof is a separate reshus) allow one to carry 2 amos on a roof and 2 amos on a pillar of the same height?
 - **Q: Rabbah** asked, the roof is a karmelis (according the way **Rav** explained the **Rabanan**) and the top of the pillar is a reshus hayachid. It would clearly be assur to transfer from one to the other!? **A: Rami bar Chama** was asking whether one can transfer from the roof of a house to the roof of an un-walled structure. On the one hand, they are both places that are not fit for living, (and are not as distinct as the roof of 2 separate houses) and therefore should be considered a single reshus. On the other hand, maybe they are treated like any other 2 roofs of houses and therefore it would be assur to transfer from one to the next.
- **Q: R' Bibi bar Abaye** asked, would the **Rabanan** (who say that each roof is a separate reshus) allow one to carry 2 amos on a roof and 2 amos in a ruin?
 - **Q: R' Kahana** asked him, aren't you asking the same question as **Rami bar Chama**? **A:** He said, my question is different because a ruin is fit to live in, as opposed to an un-walled structure, which is not.
 - **Q:** If it is fit to live in, the **Rabanan** would *certainly* not allow the transfer of items from one to the other!? **A:** His question was whether it is assur because it is fit to live in, or whether it would be mutar because a ruin has no current residents.
 - The Gemara says **TEIKU**.
- If there are a number of roofs that are on the same level (according to **R' Meir** who treats them as one reshus) or one large roof (even according to the **Rabanan** this is one reshus): **Rav** says one may carry around the entire area, and **Shmuel** says one may only carry within 4 amos.
 - **Q: Rav** said earlier according to the **Rabanan** that one may only carry within 4 amos!? **A:** In that case the walls were not noticeable so he didn't say "gud asik". In this case the walls are visible, so through gud asik he allows carrying throughout the entire roof.
 - **Q: Shmuel** said earlier according to the **Rabanan** that one may carry throughout the roof!? **A:** That case was where the roof was smaller than a beis sasayim. In this case the roof is larger than a beis sasayim and the walls are not considered to "surround it for dwelling purposes", because the walls around the roof were built for purposes of the house, not the roof. Therefore the roof has the status of a karfaf that was not walled for residential purposes, in which case one may only carry within 4 amos.
- With regard to a ship whose area is larger than a beis sasayim: **Rav** says one may carry throughout the entire ship, and **Shmuel** says one may only carry within 4 amos.
 - **Rav** says the walls of the ship act to allow carrying throughout. **Shmuel** says the walls were built to keep out the water (not for residential purposes), therefore carrying is only allowed within 4 amos.
 - **Q: R' Chiya bar Yosef** asked **Shmuel**, who do we pasken like? **A: Shmuel** said we pasken like **Rav**.
 - **R' Gidal in the name of R' Chiya bar Yosef** says that **Rav** would agree, if the ship was turned upside-down (on dry land), one may only carry up to 4 amos on the bottom of this ship (that is now above the ground).
 - **Q:** If it was turned over to live under it, the area on top of the overturned ship should be like any other roof, which **Rav** said one may carry even if larger than a beis sasayim because the walls allow for that!? **A:** The boat was turned over to allow for tarring, so the walls are not considered to be there for residential use.

- **R' Ashi** says that **Shmuel** said we pasken like **Rav**, not regarding the case of the roof, but rather with regard to the case of the ship. **R' Acha the son of Rava** said that it was said regarding the case of an un-walled, but roofed structure. In that case, **Rav** said we view the roof as extending to the floor from its edge and thus creating walls, therefore one may carry throughout. **Shmuel** said we don't view it that way and therefore carrying is only allowed within 4 amos.
- **Q: Rav** had said that **R' Meir** allows carrying throughout all the adjoining roofs (he treats them as a reshus hayachid). If so, according to **Rav**, **R' Meir** should also allow transfer from a roof to a chatzer (which is also a reshus hayachid)!? **A:** He doesn't allow it because of the gezeirah of **R' Yitzchak bar Avdimi** mentioned on the last Daf.
- **Q: Shmuel** had said that the **Rabanan** treat a roof larger than a beis sasayim like a karmelis. If so, they should allow transfer between it and a karfaf!? **A: Rava bar Ulla** said, they don't allow it as a gezeirah that the roof may be diminished and thereby get the status of a reshus hayachid (from which it would be assur to transfer to a karmelis).
 - **Q:** If so, that concern should be present in every karfaf!? **A:** A regular karfaf has walls, so it is easily discernible if the area has been diminished. A roof has no actual walls, so it is not easily noticeable. Therefore, we must be goizer.