



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

### Shabbos Daf Mem Hey

- **Reish Lakish** asked **R' Yochanan**, if one actively showed that he has no intention of using something on Shabbos (e.g., he plants kernels of wheat or puts an egg to warm under a chicken), would the item be muktzeh according to **R' Shimon** since he showed his intent not to use these items on Shabbos? He answered, the only thing **R' Shimon** considers to be muktzeh is the oil of a lamp while it is burning, because it is set aside for the mitzvah ("huktzeh l'mitzvaso") AND set aside because it is a prohibited use ("huktzeh l'isuro").
  - **Q:** We find that **R' Shimon** says that "huktzeh l'mitzvaso" is alone enough to make something muktzeh!? A Braisa says that one may not use succah decorations during all 7 days of Succos (because it is huktzeh l'mitzvaso). This Braisa is the view of **R' Shimon**, because we find elsewhere that **R' Shimon** says that one may not take wood from a succah for all 7 days of Succos (because it is huktzeh l'mitzvaso)!? **A:** **R' Yochanan** meant, that **R' Shimon** says there is din of muktzeh when something is huktzeh l'mitzvaso, but only for as long as the mitzvah lasts (e.g., the oil lamp is assur only while the lamp is lit, but once it goes out it is no longer assur). Once the mitzvah is completed, it is no longer assur (even though it was assur bein hashmashos).
- **R' Yehuda in the name of Shmuel** says, the only food that is muktzeh according to **R' Shimon** is dried figs and raisins that were put on the roof to dry before Shabbos and are not yet dry. They are inedible and therefore muktzeh.
  - **Q:** A Braisa says that all fruit put out to dry are muktzeh!? This must be following **R' Shimon**, because according to **R' Yehuda** there is no chiddush that they are muktzeh!? **A:** The Braisa follows **R' Yehuda**. The chiddush is, since he was eating these fruits and took the leftovers to the roof to dry, one would think that it would not become muktzeh (since he was eating from them). The Braisa teaches us, that since they were taken to the roof to dry, they become muktzeh.
- **R' Shimon bar Rebbi** asked **Rebbi**, according to **R' Shimon**, are unripe dates muktzeh? The person did not actively show that he has no intention of eating them on Shabbos, so is it muktzeh or not? **Rebbi** answered, the only foods that are muktzeh according to **R' Shimon** are dried figs and raisins.
  - **Q:** From the fact that **Rebbi** was asked about and answered for **R' Shimon**, it must be that he holds like **R' Shimon**. That is problematic to say, because we find that **Rebbi** does not allow the "shechting" of wild animals on Yom Tov, because they are muktzeh. That means that **Rebbi** holds like **R' Yehuda**!? **A1:** He holds like **R' Shimon**, and **R' Shimon** agrees that wild animals are muktzeh. **A2:** **Rebbi** holds like **R' Yehuda**, but was answering his son according to **R' Shimon** although he doesn't hold like him. **A3:** **Rebbi** holds like **R' Shimon**, and in the case of shechting the animals he was answering according to the **Rabanan** who don't hold of muktzeh.
- **Rabba bar bar Chana in the name of R' Yochanan** said, "they said" the halacha follows **R' Shimon**.
  - **Q:** Does **R' Yochanan** really hold like **R' Shimon**? **R' Yochanan** said that a chicken coop is muktzeh, which means that he holds like **R' Yehuda**!? **A:** He was discussing a coop that had a dead chic, which even **R' Shimon** agrees is muktzeh.
    - **Q:** That is ok according to the view that **R' Shimon** says a dead chic is muktzeh, but what about according to those who say that **R' Shimon** says it is not muktzeh?! **A:** **R' Yochanan** is discussing where a new egg was laid in the coop and therefore it is nolad, which even **R' Shimon** holds is assur.

- **Q:** What about according to those who say that **R' Shimon** says nolad is mutar? **A:** **R' Yochanan** is discussing a coop that has an egg with a chic in it that has yet to hatch. That is assur even according to that view of **R' Shimon**. So, it is possible that **R' Yochanan** follows **R' Shimon**.
- **R' Yitzchak the son of R' Yosef** said that **R' Yochanan** paskens like **R' Yehuda**, and **R' Yehoshua ben Levi** paskens like **R' Shimon**. **R' Yosef** said, that must be what **R' Yochanan** meant that “they said” the halacha follows **R' Shimon**. He was referring to **R' Yehoshua ben Levi**, but **R' Yochanan** himself hold like **R' Yehuda**.
- **Abaye** asked **R' Yosef**, even without that it is clear that **R' Yochanan** follows **R' Yehuda**, because **R' Assi** (a talmid of **R' Yochanan**) didn't move a menorah that fell on his clothing, because he felt it was muktzeh, which he must have learned from his rebbi, **R' Yochanan**! **R' Yosef** replied, that we find a machlokes between **Reish Lakish** and **R' Yochanan** regarding whether one may move a lightweight menorah. However, they both hold, that a heavyweight menorah is assur to move even according to **R' Shimon**. Therefore, the fact that **R' Assi** would not move the menorah could have even been following **R' Shimon**.
  - **Rabbah and R' Yosef** explain that the reason a heavy menorah is assur to move is because a person sets a specific place for a large menorah and doesn't intend for it to be moved. Therefore, it is assur to move it.
    - **Q:** **Abaye** asked **R' Yosef**, we find other things with set places (like a canopy over a bed) that may be moved, so that can't be why a menorah is assur?! **A:** Rather, **Abaye** said, **R' Shimon** only prohibits moving a menorah made of pieces, because moving it may break it apart which will cause someone to put it back together and thereby “make” a keili on Shabbos, which is forbidden.
    - **Q:** Why is a lightweight menorah permitted? The same concern should apply?! **A:** **R' Shimon** prohibits moving a large menorah that *looks like* it is made of pieces, but is truly one piece, because if we were to allow it, people would think they could move a menorah that is truly made of pieces as well, which can lead to it breaking and putting it back together. There was no such gezeirah made for a small menorah that only looks like it is made of many pieces.