



Today's Daf In Review is being sent l'zecher nishmas Habachur Yechezkel Shraga A"H ben R' Avrohom Yehuda

### Shabbos Daf Lamed

#### MISHNA

- If one extinguishes a flame out of fear of the goyim or robbers, or due to a "ruach rah", or for a sick person who is sleeping, he is patur.
- If he extinguishes it to save the lamp, the oil or the wick, he is chayuv. **R' Yose** says he is patur except for the case where he is trying to save the wick, because in doing so he creates charcoal

#### GEMARA

- **Q:** The **T"K** says he is chayuv in the second set of cases. This is the view of **R' Yehuda** who says that one who performs a "melacha she'eina tzricha l'gufa" is chayuv. If so, in the first set of cases, why is he patur for extinguishing for the choleh? If he is seriously ill, it should be mutar (not just "patur"). If he is not seriously ill, he should be chayuv according to **R' Yehuda**?! **A:** We are discussing a seriously ill individual, and it is therefore totally mutar. The reason the Mishna says "patur" is to be stylistically in sync with the second set of cases in which the person is "chayuv".
  - The Braisa which says that one who extinguishes a flame for a choleh it is patur but assur, that is talking about a person that is not seriously ill and follows the shita of **R' Shimon**.
- The question was posed to **R' Tanchum of Nevi** - May one extinguish a candle for a seriously ill person? Before answering, he gave the following drasha, and said:
  - "Shlomo! Where is your wisdom and understanding?" Shlomo Hamelech's words don't only contradict those of his father Dovid, they even contradict his own words. Dovid says "Lo hameisim yihalilu Kah" (the living are better than the dead), and in Koheles, Shlomo says "V'shabeach ani es hameisim" (the dead are better than the living). Also in Koheles Shlomo then says "Ki l'kelev chai hu tov min h'aryeh hameis" (the living are better)." **R' Tanchum** explained that it is not contradictory. Dovid meant that the living can still perform Torah and Mitzvos and in that way are better than the dead. When Shlomo praised the dead he was referring to specific meisim: either the Avos, in whose z'chus the Yidden were forgiven for the Chet Ha'Egel; or Moshe Rabeinu who lived so long ago, but whose gezeiros live on forever; or Dovid Hamelech, in whose z'chus the doors of the Kodosh Hakodashim opened up when the Aron was being brought in at the time when the building of the Beis Hamikdash was completed (this was done to show all of Klal Yisrael that Dovid was forgiven for his aveirah with Bas Sheva). Finally, when Shlomo praised the living, he was referring to a specific incident that occurred when Dovid died. The Malach Hamaves was unable to cause Dovid's death because he was constantly learning Torah. The Malach caused a commotion outside which caused Dovid to go and see what was going on. On his way up the stairs, a stair gave way and Dovid fell. As he hit the ground, he stopped his learning, giving the Malach the ability to cause his death. Dovid's body was left out in the sun. Shlomo asked the Rabanim 2 questions: how he could feed Dovid's dogs and how he could move Dovid's body out of the sun. The Rabanim told him he could cut up a neveilah for the dogs and place a piece of bread on Dovid and then move the entire body. That is what caused Shlomo to say that a live dog is better than a dead lion.
  - With regard to the original question asked, **R' Tarfon** answered that a "man-made" flame may be extinguished to save a "G-dly flame" (i.e. the neshama of the seriously ill person).

- **R' Yehuda the son of Shmuel bar Shilas in the name of Rav** said, the **Chachomim** wanted to hide Sefer Koheles because it is self-contradictory, but they decided not to because the beginning is divrei Torah and the end is divrei Torah.
  - The “beginning is divrei Torah” where it asks – What does a person gain with all the work that he works under the sun? **R' Yannai's** Yeshiva explains, work done under the sun has no gain, but work done *before* the sun (i.e. the Torah, which was created before the sun) has a lot of gain. The “end is divrei Torah” where it states – After all is done, fear Hashem and keep his mitzvos, “ki zeh kol ha'adam”. This last part means, that one who does as the pasuk says: **R' Eliezer** says the whole world was created for him; **R' Abba bar Kahana** says he is equal to the entire world; **Shimon ben Azzai** says the world was created as an accompaniment for this person.
  - One contradiction is, in one place it says anger is better than laughter, in another place it says laughter is praiseworthy. This can be answered because anger refers to the “anger” that Hashem shows to the tzadikim in this world by punishing them to cleanse them of their sins, and that is better than the laughter (the good) that He shows the resha'im on this world which rewards them on this world and sets them up for gehinom. Where it says that laughter is praiseworthy, it refers to the laughter, the good, that Hashem shows to the tzadikim in Olam Habbah.
  - Another contradiction is, in one place it praises joy, in another it says it is of no use. This is answered by explaining that the first place refers to joy of a mitzvah, the second, to other joys. This teaches that the Shechina only rests amidst the joy of a mitzvah.
    - **R' Yehuda** says, joy is also important for learning halachos. **Rava** says, joy leads to having good dreams.
      - Although **R' Gidal in the name of Rav** says that one must learn with fear in front of his Rebbi, that refers to the talmid. However, the Rebbi must have joy. Or we can say that even a Rebbi should begin amid joy and then get very serious.
- They also considered hiding Mishlei because of contradictions. They then said, we see that the contradictions in Koheles were answered. The contradictions in Mishlei can surely be answered as well.
  - One contradiction is, in one place it says not to answer a fool, in another place it says to answer a fool. This can be answered, that a person should answer a fool when he questions divrei Torah, but should not answer a fool who questions other matters.
    - We see that when someone made claims that **Rebbi's** children were mamzeirem, and that **R' Gamliel** was himself a mamzer, they simply did not address their claims, and these people were punished and killed.
    - We see that when people challenged **R' Gamliel's** claim of words of Torah, he did answer them and proved them wrong. He said that b'zman Moshiach women will conceive and give birth the same day. A talmid laughed and said “Ein kol chadash tachas hashemesh”. He showed the talmid that this phenomenon currently exists in chickens. He also said that b'zman Moshiach trees will bear fruit every day. A talmid laughed with the same comment. He showed him the tzlaf tree which grows different fruit quickly. He said that b'zman Moshiach Eretz Yisrael will grow rolls and wool clothing. A talmid laughed with the same comment. He showed him mushrooms which grow quick, complete and look like rolls, and he showed him the wooly substance under the bark of a palm tree which looks like wool.